**Introduction:**

For the 2017-2018 Assessment of Program Learning Outcomes , both BEdA programs, Adult Basic Education (ABE) and AESL, worked together to assess the following program specific outcomes related to equity.

* AESL: Working effectively as team members with persons of diverse cultures, styles and beliefs.
* ABE: Use interpersonal skills and strategies in a multicultural context to work collaboratively, solve problems, and perform tasks.

The College Wide Student Learning Outcome most closely associated with these program outcomes is: Intercultural Collaboration and Diversity: Demonstrate successful application of an independent, diverse and multicultural worldview through collaborative engagement.

In order to identify gaps and create and share best practices within our program, the goal of the project was to collect faculty perspectives, methods and assignments relevant to our outcome and develop student and faculty surveys that assess: 1) students’ awareness of cultural diversity; 2) importance and impact of classroom activities that focus on developing intercultural collaboration; 3) whether teachers’ activities have the intended impact.

Wendi Fein, Lee Sledd, Susan Lawler, Staci Snyder, and Allison Muir worked together on the proposal during fall quarter. Then, Lee, Susan, and Allison implemented the project during winter quarter, by creating an instructor survey and a student survey in Survey Monkey. Survey Monkey was chosen for ease of delivery and use as well as for accessibility. Questions were discussed and edited through face-to-face and online discussion. The survey links, along with an explanation for context and ideas for classroom implementation, were shared with BEda faculty via Email and also explained at both ABE’s and AESL’s program department meetings. The 10 surveys administered to students in the lowest level of AESL were paper based because it is a more effective method for surveying students with lower levels of English skill and comprehension. 136 students completed the student survey (58% AESL, 37% ABE, 5% Dev. ED-Note: one of the ABE classes was linked with a Dev. Ed section). 10 instructors completed the faculty survey (50% AESL, 50% ABE). Finally, in spring quarter, survey results were analyzed for trends, which prompted questions and recommendations. Lee, Susan, and Allison divided the questions so that each researcher was responsible for analyzing two student survey questions and two instructor survey questions. Individually, they examined responses to identify trends. The trends were listed along with example responses that illustrated the major themes. Susan, Allison, and Lee met to discuss the trends, questions, and recommendations. The findings are outlined below. The information gathered through this project is worth further investigation and discussion, and Lee, Susan, and Allison are open to discussing their findings with the larger campus community to highlight the connections between these program outcomes and the degree learning outcome (ICD) to support improved retention

**Limitations of study:** Only about 1/3 of BEdA faculty completed and, most likely, administered the survey to students. It is safe to assume that these are instructors who value the PLO, so the results may not be representative of the program as a whole. We would like to see increased participation. We also assume from the responses that the majority of instructors and students are from the reading/writing part of our program, and we would like to have a sense of how the math side of our program addresses the PLO and hear more about the experiences of ABE math students in this context. Still, there is value in our findings, as they prompt a continued dialogue on equity.

**Student Survey**

**Q4** Do you feel comfortable talking with people whose life experiences and ideas are very different from yours in class? Why or why not?

**Total Responses =**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| YES = 113 | Open-mindedness/Learning from others | Hearing about other cultures is interesting | Rights and Respect | It’s important to understand each other | Helping each other |  |  |
| # of responses | 69 | 22 | 14 | 3 | 2 |  |  |
| examples | * “I feel comfortable talking with people whose life experiences and ideas are very different from me in class because it’s time for me to get more knowledge and more experiences from them.” * “yes, because some times it helps to see others views and points to show me a new way of looking at things.” * “I feel comfortable talking with people whose life experiences and ideas are very different from yours in class. Because that is the best way to connect with others together and understand more about them, but I do not focus to much on their life experiences.” * “Yes, because every single person has an opinion. I like speak with people, we talk, thing and share our ideas. It is so good for our world view and others.” * “Yes, I do because I love hearing about different life experiences because some can be very interesting, also it can open my mind to many different points of view.” * “Yes, because we are able Share different solutions that are helpful” * “Yes, because my ESL school mate they are different people but a nice and helping” | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| NO = 7 |  |
| # of responses | 7 |
| examples | * “No I don’t because I feel not confident my communication” * “No. This is my first time in college and everything is strange.” * “not really because some people think that he/she is right and does not listen others” |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| YES and NO = 4 |  |
| # of responses | 4 |
| responses | * “I like to know about other cultures but my culture is nice.” * “I feel kinda comfortable about talking with people about life experiences. I don’t open up to people that easily. I’m learning how to communicate.” * “Yes and No. Yes because it’s a learning experience and no because I wouldn’t want to offend anyone who thinks different or is different in the beliefs area.” * “Depends on how comfortable I feel around my classmates.” |

**Findings:**

* Most students remain open and comfortable talking with people from diverse backgrounds, and even appear eager to do so.
* Students wish to engage with those who are “different” not only because “it’s interesting,” but because they want to *learn* from others.
* A smaller number of students feel unsure of how to step out of their ‘comfort zone’ to interact with those with backgrounds that which they perceive as different from their own.
* Question: What motivates many students to want to learn about other cultures? The goal of self-improvement? Or simply curiosity?
* Question: How open would students be to self-reflection based on \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

developing a critical consciousness and increasing self-awareness based on differences

* Question: [Do what degree are students receptive to learning about differences? ]
* Recommendation: Create more opportunities for students to interact cross-culturally.
* Recommendation: Respond to students’ clear desire to learn about other cultures and have students explicitly share aspects of their cultures.
* Recommendation: Offer PD opportunities for instructors to share methods and/or learn how to create a culturally responsive classroom environment and ho

for encouraging the sharing of cultures and creating classroom environments

* ~~Recommendation: Offer opportunities for students to reflect on how a collaborative and culturally responsive classroom environment relates to their learning and retention of course materials. This could be in the form of informal memos or discussion boards or as more formal reflections in portfolios.~~
* ~~Recommendation: Offer PD opportunities (ie: round tables) for instructors to share about assignments and teaching methodology that connects to the PLO. We could create language for a rubric criterion that addresses the PLO.~~

**Student Survey**

**Q5** What can help people to communicate better and resolve conflict when they don’t agree?

**~~Total Responses = 132~~**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| ~~YES = 124~~ | ~~Class content and activities discussed the importance of diversity and collaboration~~ | ~~Content pushed students to think in different ways about cultural perspectives~~ | ~~Opportunities to share about their own cultures~~ | ~~Group projects and opportunities for student collaboration~~ | ~~Discussions that encourage differing view points~~ | ~~Teacher created a welcoming environment, showed interest in students’ cultures~~ | ~~Classroom community, building relationships with classmates~~ |
| ~~# of responses~~ | ~~7~~ | ~~6~~ | ~~4~~ | ~~11~~ | ~~5~~ | ~~10~~ | ~~11~~ |
| ~~examples~~ | * ~~“yes, when we circle up as a class and can talk among our classes mates. Helps me to view others point of view and understandings.”~~ * ~~“Yes, through class history we have learned how togetherness is vital.”~~ * ~~“Yes, I’ve learned ways of understanding how to learn of what is going on in the world we live in, what is happening to the environment and what we could think of ideas.”~~ * ~~“Well she always wanted people to feel welcomed in class and feel like they belong where no one is judging anyone. She made it a safe place for all students no matter what you looked like, or what you believed in etc.”~~ * ~~“Yes we have a very diverse class and we partner up with different people and it just makes things easier knowing your classmates instead of having to talk in front of 20 strangers.”~~ | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ~~NO = 3~~ | ~~Personal choice to not participate~~ |
| ~~# of responses~~ | ~~1~~ |
| ~~examples~~ | * ~~“Sort of, I don’t put much commitment into TCC, I only do it because I have to. “~~ |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| ~~MISC = 5~~ | ~~I don’t know, not sure~~ |
| ~~# of responses~~ | ~~5~~ |

**~~Findings:~~**

* ~~Students recognize friendly, welcoming classroom environments as safe places for discussion and collaboration.~~
* ~~Students associate group work and collaborating with classmates with learning about each other.~~
* ~~Students appreciate opportunities to share about their cultures and learn about others.~~
* ~~Students recognize their teachers as intentionally modeling collaboration and supporting community building the classroom~~
* ~~Question: Do students feel these components directly relate to their learning and retention of course material?~~
* ~~Question: How do we push students to describe specific activities and/or assignments that relate to diversity?~~
* ~~Recommendation: Help students connect specific classroom activities to diversity by explicitly discussing the PLO as an outcome for the assignment.~~
* ~~Recommendation: Offer opportunities for students to reflect on how a collaborative and culturally responsive classroom environment relates to their learning and retention of course materials. This could be in the form of informal memos or discussion boards or as more formal reflections in portfolios.~~
* ~~Recommendation: Offer PD opportunities (ie: round tables) for instructors to share about assignments and teaching methodology that connects to the PLO. We could create language for a rubric criterion that addresses the PLO.~~

**Student Survey**

**Q6** Has your instructor done activities or assigned work that has helped you to learn about and appreciate different people in class?

**Total Responses = 132**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| YES = 124 | Class content and activities discussed the importance of diversity and collaboration | Content pushed students to think in different ways about cultural perspectives | Opportunities to share about their own cultures | Group projects and opportunities for student collaboration | Discussions that encourage differing view points | Teacher created a welcoming environment, showed interest in students’ cultures | Classroom community, building relationships with classmates |
| # of responses | 7 | 6 | 4 | 11 | 5 | 10 | 11 |
| examples | * “yes, when we circle up as a class and can talk among our classes mates. Helps me to view others point of view and understandings.” * “Yes, through class history we have learned how togetherness is vital.” * “Yes, I’ve learned ways of understanding how to learn of what is going on in the world we live in, what is happening to the environment and what we could think of ideas.” * “Well she always wanted people to feel welcomed in class and feel like they belong where no one is judging anyone. She made it a safe place for all students no matter what you looked like, or what you believed in etc.” * “Yes we have a very diverse class and we partner up with different people and it just makes things easier knowing your classmates instead of having to talk in front of 20 strangers.” | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| NO = 3 | Personal choice to not participate |
| # of responses | 1 |
| examples | * “Sort of, I don’t put much commitment into TCC, I only do it because I have to. “ |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| MISC = 5 | I don’t know, not sure |
| # of responses | 5 |

**Findings:**

* Students recognize friendly, welcoming classroom environments as safe places for discussion and collaboration.
* Students associate group work and collaborating with classmates with learning about each other.
* Students appreciate opportunities to share about their cultures and learn about others.
* Students recognize their teachers as intentionally modeling collaboration and supporting community building the classroom
* Question: Do students feel these components directly relate to their learning and retention of course material?
* Question: How do we push students to describe specific activities and/or assignments that relate to diversity?
* Recommendation: Help students connect specific classroom activities to diversity by explicitly discussing the PLO as an outcome for the assignment.
* Recommendation: Offer opportunities for students to reflect on how a collaborative and culturally responsive classroom environment relates to their learning and retention of course materials. This could be in the form of informal memos or discussion boards or as more formal reflections in portfolios.
* Recommendation: Offer PD opportunities (ie: round tables) for instructors to share about assignments and teaching methodology that connects to the PLO. We could create language for a rubric criterion that addresses the PLO.

**Q7** Does your instructor create an environment where everyone is welcomed and respected? What do they say or do that support this?

**Total Responses = 133**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| YES = 128 | Instructor created a friendly environment  that encourages collaboration | Relationships are positive between students | Instructor treats students equally | Teachers makes sure students work with different people | Teacher cares for students | Teacher emphasized that our class is a safe space. Explicitly states in syllabus. | Assignments help students get to know each other and share about their cultures | Students helped make rules around respectful environment (agreements |
| # of responses | 27 | 11 | 14 | 3 | 13 | 5 | 16 | 3 |
| examples | * “Yes, she did. She is very open with everyone in the class. Give us ideas and how to help each other.” * “Yes she does. I believe she truly cares about her students and their education. She would always make sure every students was able to do their assignments and made sure they knew how to do their assignments. She would always ask people from time to time if they were okay or how things are going in their life.” * “Yes, they emphasized that our classroom is a safe space at the first class and put it in our syllabus. They always make sure everyone is goof and make sure everyone can have their own opinion and its okay.” * “Yes. We have a very friendly atmosphere in the classroom and all the relationships with each other and with the teacher are very good.” * “Yes at the beginning of the course we made posters that held an agreement of what each person expects the environment to be, also coming together and defining what form of respect any human-being should receive.” | | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| NO = 2 | No elaboration |
| # of responses | 2 |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| MISC = 3 | I don’t know, not sure |
| # of responses | 3 |

**Findings:**

* Students recognize teacher’s efforts to create a friendly, welcoming classroom environment.
* Students appreciate opportunities for group work and collaboration with classmates.
* Students appreciate building positive relationships with their classmates and connect this with group work.
* Students recognize when they have voice and are included in the process of creating norms in the classroom.
* Students notice when teachers explicitly state the classroom is a safe space.
* Question: How does this impact students overall feeling of safety and well being on the campus?
* Question: What role do students see they play in creating a safe and welcoming classroom environment?
* Recommendation: Include students in the decision making process and in creating norms for classroom discussion and interaction.
* Recommendation: Use student focus groups as an opportunity to learn more about how classroom environment connects to the students’ overall experience of safety and well-being on campus.
* Recommendation: Include social emotional learning (SEL) into class curriculum.
* Recommendation: Offer PD opportunities on the topic of SEL.

**Instructor Survey**

**Q6** Have you managed a difference of opinion or cultural conflict in your class? How did you approach the situation and what was the outcome?

**Total Responses = 10**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| YES = 7, with specific example | allowing some discomfort if handled correctly is good for learning | being proactive about building a respectful classroom community | issues with one cultural group not wanting to work with another or cultural groups that have strong prejudices against other groups | importance of modeling vulnerability | Explicit discussion of bias and discomfort | listening | redirection | Empowering students to share their stories and differences in opinion | humor | neutrality |
| # of responses | 4 | 4 | 3 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 3 | 7 | 1 | 2 |
| examples | * “I used to shut the conversation down when it got uncomfortable, but I am getting better at asking probing questions or redirecting students. I'm also getting better at letting the conversation get a little uncomfortable and naming that for students and explaining why I think that discomfort is an important part of learning. The best management technique is to be proactive. We have clear norms for discussion, we talk about active listening, and we make sure that everyone agrees that we don't argue with personal experience. If students have relationships with each other, they are more apt to listen and respond respectfully even if they disagree.” * “One strategy I have used to prevent students from feeling excluded is to praise the students who very clearly step out of their comfort zone to sit and work with classmates from different cultures and who speak very different languages. Regarding difference of opinion or cultural conflict, if I sense any amount of tension, I very carefully use humor steer it away from the ego in order to keep the conversation constructive. On the other hand, there are times the tension is unavoidable and even useful. From a neutral position (as much as is possible), I ask questions to help each 'side' analyze their perspectives and try to become or remain as objective as possible.” * “Establishing respectful conversation guidelines, giving space to just listen, reminding students of the parallels of these discussions in public discourse are all good ways to handle this. Our own discomfort is also important and I think it's OK to not always be able to diffuse everything but recognize that those positions include emotion.” * “Students learned more with the open sharing.” * “I strive for a class where people can practice civilly exchanging their different ideas, with the expectation that disagreement and difference is to be expected and accepted.” | | | | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| NO = 2 | No elaboration |
| # of responses | 2 |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| MISC = 1 | General response |
| # of responses | 1 |

**Findings:**

* Instructors recognize the value in having uncomfortable discussions.
* Instructors see value in explicitly teaching about bias.
* Instructors see value in creating spaces for students to share differing opinion.
* Instructors believe being proactive about building classroom community greatly reduces difficult or tense conflicts in the classroom.
* Question: How can we as instructors improve our ability to facilitate difficult conversations in ways that further learning?
* Question: Is it important for instructors to remain neutral?
* Question: How can we get better at helping students and instructors recognize their own bias?
* Recommendations: Offer PD opportunities to discuss best practices in facilitating brave conversations on campus.
* Recommendations: Offer opportunities for teachers to revise syllabi and assignments through the lens of equity.

**Q7** As part of addressing this outcomes is it our role to explore issues such as racism, stereotypes and bias? Are there ways of approaching these concepts which are more or less productive?

**Total Responses = 10**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| YES = 6, with specific example | Equity is part of TCC’s mission | These are hard conversations, teaching these concepts is challenging | Students need to have opportunities to share their experiences and hear about others’ experiences | It needs to be explicit | Teachers acknowledge systems of privilege and power (especially their own) | Opportunities to teach this in contextualized classes | Exposing students to different voices that represent a variety of racial and cultural identities through texts and curriculum | Importance of meaningful discussion and dialogue about these topics |
| # of responses | 2 | 4 | 6 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 5 | 7 |
| examples | * “Yes - Equity is a TCC college mission. I think what I've explained previously shows productive ways to approaching these concepts. One has to be careful, though, not to cause students to shut down by simply telling them they need to be more open to people from other cultures. The best strategy, I think, is to share stories from different cultures (that include the good and the bad) that help people relate better to one another, connect to one another, and discover on their own the beauty of collaboration across cultures.” * “Yes, it has to absolutely be part of every class. There are a multitude of ways to approach these. A great start would be to help instructors see their own privilege in the system that is trying to help our students, employing student voice heavily in the curriculum is another. “ * “Absolutely. Giving students text, videos and articles that promote critical thinking and discussion is very productive. As a teacher, it's important to have students set norms for discussions and facilitate them * “There has to be ways to address these issues. For some students, they occur and/or they deal with them every single day. I would love to explore dialogue that would open meaningful discussions about the diversity that exists in every one of our classrooms. Of course, positive discussions would be great, but some dissent would, I think, have to be part of the issue as well….I also perhaps naively believe that when we address these issues, we also address persistence, attrition, apathy, and lack of motivation.” | | | | | | | |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| MISC = 4 | Not negative, but not a clear yes 4 - questioning/not sure how effective these conversations are |
| examples | * “I don't think our role should be advocates, exactly. However, Winter Quarter, which includes Black History Month, provides a great opportunity in Levels 5/6 to do an extended lesson on U.S. history as it relates to the racism and segregation/integration.” * “I don't know how effective lessons on these topics are. Nonetheless I think it is useful for students to recognize that we are all biased.” |

**Findings:**

* Instructors believe it is part of the outcome to address bias, stereotypes and racism.
* Instructors acknowledge the challenge in facilitating these discussions, but agree that they are important.
* Instructors believe contextualized classes offer opportunities to implement culturally relevant and responsive pedagogy.
* Question: How can we create PD opportunities to help instructors develop confidence in facilitating uncomfortable conversations?
* Question: How can the college as a whole increase support for implementing culturally relevant and responsive practices in TCC classrooms.
* Recommendations: Continue to build and share culturally responsive contextualized curriculum that embeds SEL competencies.
* Recommendations for Q 6 also relate to the findings here.